

Solutions of Homework #3

1. **Claim** : \mathcal{S}_E is a σ -algebra on E .

Suppose that $B \in \mathcal{S}_E \Rightarrow \exists A \in \mathcal{S}$ such that $B = A \cap E$.

$\therefore B^c = A^c \cap E$.

Since \mathcal{S} is a σ -algebra $\Rightarrow A^c \in \mathcal{S} \Rightarrow B^c \in \mathcal{S}_E$.

Suppose $B_i \in \mathcal{S}_E \Rightarrow \exists A_i \in \mathcal{S}$ such that $B_i = A_i \cap E$.

$\therefore \bigcap_{i=1}^{\infty} B_i = \bigcap_{i=1}^{\infty} (A_i \cap E) = (\bigcap_{i=1}^{\infty} A_i) \cap E$.

Since \mathcal{S} is a σ -algebra $\Rightarrow \bigcap_{i=1}^{\infty} A_i \in \mathcal{S} \Rightarrow \bigcap_{i=1}^{\infty} B_i \in \mathcal{S}_E$.

Therefore \mathcal{S}_E is a σ -algebra on E .

Claim : ν is a measure on E .

(1) : ν is well-defined.

By the assumption, $\mu^*(X) = \mu^*(E)$, we have

$$\mu^*(X) = \mu^*(A \cap X) + \mu^*(A^c \cap X) = \mu^*(A \cap E) + \mu^*(A^c \cap E) = \mu^*(E)$$

Since $A = A \cap X \supseteq A \cap E \Rightarrow \mu^*(A) = \mu^*(A \cap X) \geq \mu^*(A \cap E)$,
and $A^c = A^c \cap X \supseteq A^c \cap E \Rightarrow \mu^*(A^c) = \mu^*(A^c \cap X) \geq \mu^*(A^c \cap E)$.
 $\therefore \mu^*(X)$ is finite and $\mu^*(X) = \mu^*(E)$, we have

$$\mu^*(A) = \mu^*(A \cap E) \text{ and } \mu^*(A^c) = \mu^*(A^c \cap E).$$

Similarly, $\mu^*(B) = \mu^*(B \cap E)$. Therefore

$$\mu(A) = \mu^*(A) = \mu^*(A \cap E) = \mu^*(B \cap E) = \mu^*(B) = \mu(B).$$

(2) : $\nu(\emptyset) = 0$

$$\nu(\emptyset) = \nu(\emptyset \cap E) = \nu(\emptyset) = 0.$$

(3) : $A \cap E \supseteq B \cap E \Rightarrow \nu(A \cap E) \geq \nu(B \cap E)$.

Since ν is well-defined, $\therefore (A \cap E) \supseteq (B \cap E) \Rightarrow \mu(A) \geq \mu(B)$.

Therefore $\nu(A \cap E) = \mu(A) \geq \mu(B) = \nu(B \cap E)$.

(4) : Countable additivity.

Let $B_i = A_i \cap E \in \mathcal{S}_E$, $A_i \in \mathcal{S}$ and $B_i \cap B_j = \emptyset$, $\forall i \neq j$.

Let $C_1 = A_1$, $C_i = A_i \setminus (\bigcup_{j=1}^{i-1} A_j)$, $\forall i \geq 2$.

$\therefore C_i \in \mathcal{S}$, $\bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} A_i = \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} C_i$, C_i disjoint, and

$$C_i \cap E = B_i = A_i \cap E.$$

Therefore

$$\begin{aligned} \nu\left(\bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} B_i\right) &= \nu\left(\bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} (A_i \cap E)\right) = \mu\left(\bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} A_i\right) \\ &= \mu\left(\bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} C_i\right) = \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \mu(C_i) \\ &= \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \mu(A_i) = \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \nu(A_i \cap E) = \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \nu(B_i) \end{aligned}$$

2. (i) :

Suppose $B \in \mathcal{A}$, $\therefore B = ((a_1, b_1] \cup \dots \cup (a_n, b_n]) \cap X$, where

$$-\infty \leq a_1 \leq b_1 \leq a_2 \leq b_2 \leq \dots \leq a_n \leq b_n \leq \infty.$$

$\therefore B^c$ on $X = ((-\infty, a_1] \cup (\bigcup_{i=1}^{n-1} (b_i, a_{i+1}]) \cup (a_n, \infty]) \cap X$

$\therefore B^c \in \mathcal{A}$.

Suppose $C \in \mathcal{A}$, $\therefore C = ((c_1, d_1] \cup \dots \cup (c_m, d_m]) \cap X$, where

$$-\infty \leq c_1 \leq d_1 \leq c_2 \leq d_2 \leq \dots \leq c_m \leq d_m \leq \infty.$$

If $(a, b] \cap (c, d] \neq \emptyset$, then $(a, b] \cup (c, d] = (e, f]$, for some e, f .
Therefore,

$$\begin{aligned} B \cup C &= \left(\bigcup_{i=1}^n (a_i, b_i] \cap X \right) \cup \left(\bigcup_{j=1}^m (c_j, d_j] \cap X \right) \\ &= \left(\bigcup_{i=1}^n (a_i, b_i] \cup \bigcup_{j=1}^m (c_j, d_j] \right) \cap X = \left(\bigcup_{k=1}^l (e_k, f_k] \right) \cap X, \text{ for some } e_k, f_k \end{aligned}$$

$\therefore B \cup C \in \mathcal{A}$ and \mathcal{A} is an algebra.

(ii) :

Since 2^X is a σ -algebra and $\mathcal{A} \subset 2^X \Rightarrow \sigma(\mathcal{A}) \subset 2^X$.

Consider $x \in \mathbb{Q}$, since $\{x\} = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} ((x - \frac{1}{n}, x] \cap X) \Rightarrow \{x\} \in \sigma(\mathcal{A})$.

Suppose $S \in 2^X \Rightarrow S = \{x_1, x_2, \dots\}$ by the fact that X is countable.

$\therefore S = \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} \{x_i\}$, $x_i \in \mathbb{Q}$, $\forall i$.

Since $\{x_i\} \in \sigma(\mathcal{A}) \Rightarrow S \in \sigma(\mathcal{A}) \Rightarrow 2^X \subset \sigma(\mathcal{A})$.

Hence $2^X = \sigma(\mathcal{A})$.

(iii) :

Let

$$\mu_1(S) = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{if } S = \emptyset \\ \infty, & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

and $\mu_2(S) =$ the cardinality of S .

Suppose $A \in \mathcal{A}$.

If $A = \emptyset$, $\mu_1(\emptyset) = \mu_2(\emptyset) = \mu(\emptyset) = 0$.

If $A \neq \emptyset \Rightarrow A = \{x_1, x_2, \dots\} \Rightarrow \mu_1(A) = \mu_2(A) = \mu(A) = \infty$.

Therefore μ_1 and μ_2 are the extension of μ to $\sigma(\mathcal{A})$.

But $\mu_1(\{x\}) = \infty \neq 1 = \mu(\{x\})$.

Hence the extension of μ to $\sigma(\mathcal{A})$ is not unique.

3. Note : \mathcal{S} is a σ -algebra, and (X, S, μ) is a measure space, but may not be complete.

(i) By definition, $\mathcal{N}(\mu) = \{E \subset X \mid \mu^*(E) = 0\}$.

1⁰ Let $\mathcal{A} = \{E \subset X \mid E \subset N \text{ for some } N \in \mathcal{S} \text{ with } \mu(N) = 0\}$.

$\forall E \in \mathcal{A}, \exists N \in \mathcal{S} \text{ with } E \subset N \text{ such that } \mu(N) = 0.$

$\Rightarrow 0 \leq \mu^*(E) \leq \mu^*(N) = \mu(N) = 0.$

$\therefore \mu^*(E) = 0 \Rightarrow E \in \mathcal{N}(\mu).$

On the other hand, given $E \in \mathcal{N}(\mu), \exists$ measurable cover $B \in \mathcal{S}$ of E such that $E \subset B$ and $\mu(B) = \mu^*(E) = 0.$

$\therefore E \in \mathcal{A}.$

Hence $\mathcal{A} = \mathcal{N}(\mu).$

2⁰ By definition, $\mathcal{S} \vee \mathcal{N}(\mu) =$ the σ -algebra generated by $\mathcal{S} \cup \mathcal{N}(\mu).$

Let $\mathcal{B} = \{E \cup F \mid E \in \mathcal{S} \text{ and } F \in \mathcal{N}(\mu)\}.$

Obviously, $\mathcal{B} \subset \mathcal{S} \vee \mathcal{N}(\mu).$

Claim: \mathcal{B} is a σ -algebra containing $\mathcal{S} \cup \mathcal{N}(\mu).$

pf: Since $\emptyset \in \mathcal{S} \cap \mathcal{N}(\mu), \forall E \in \mathcal{S}, F \in \mathcal{N}(\mu)$

$\Rightarrow E = E \cup \emptyset \in \mathcal{B}$ and $F = \emptyset \cup F \in \mathcal{B}.$

$\therefore \mathcal{S} \cup \mathcal{N}(\mu) \subset \mathcal{B}.$ Now, we're going to prove that \mathcal{B} is a σ -algebra.

First, it's easy to see $\emptyset \in \mathcal{B}.$

Second, given $\{B_n\}_{n=1}^{\infty} \subset \mathcal{B}$

$\Rightarrow B_n = E_n \cup F_n,$ for some $E_n \in \mathcal{S}$ and $F_n \in \mathcal{N}(\mu).$ Thus,

$$\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} B_n = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} (E_n \cup F_n) = \left(\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} E_n \right) \cup \left(\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} F_n \right). \quad (1)$$

Since \mathcal{S} is a σ -algebra, $\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} E_n \in \mathcal{S}.$

Now we can choose a measurable cover N_n of $F_n,$ from the problem4, we know that $\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} N_n$ is also a measurable cover of $\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} F_n.$ Therefore

$$\mu^*\left(\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} F_n\right) \leq \mu\left(\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} N_n\right) \leq \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \mu(N_n) = 0$$

$\Rightarrow \mu^*\left(\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} F_n\right) = 0 \Rightarrow \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} F_n \in \mathcal{N}(\mu)$ (by 1⁰). Hence by (1), $\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} B_n \in \mathcal{B}.$

Third, given $B \in \mathcal{B} \Rightarrow B = E \cup F,$ for some $E \in \mathcal{S}$ and $F \in \mathcal{N}(\mu).$

$\Rightarrow \exists N \in \mathcal{S}$ such that $F \subset N$ and $\mu(N) = 0.$

$\Rightarrow B^c = (E \cup F)^c = E^c \cap F^c = (E^c \cap N^c) \cup (N \setminus F).$

Since $(N \setminus F) \subset N$ and $\mu(N) = 0, (N \setminus F) \in \mathcal{N}(\mu).$

Therefore $B^c \in \mathcal{B},$ since $E, N \in \mathcal{S},$ and we complete the proof of the claim.

(ii) : $\bar{\mu}$ is the completion of $\mu.$

$\Rightarrow \text{Dom}(\bar{\mu}) = \mathcal{S} \vee \mathcal{N}(\mu).$

(\Rightarrow) : $\forall E \subset \text{Dom}(\bar{\mu}).$

$\Rightarrow E \in \mathcal{S} \vee \mathcal{N}(\mu) = \mathcal{S}_{\mu^*} = \{E \subset X \mid E \Delta B \in \mathcal{N}(\mu), \text{ for some } B \in \mathcal{S}\}.$

$\Rightarrow \exists B \in \mathcal{S}$ s.t. $E \Delta B \in \mathcal{N}(\mu).$

\Rightarrow Let $C = E \cup B$, $A = E \cap B$.

Then $A \subset E \subset C$ and $A, C \in \text{Dom}(\bar{\mu})$, and therefore we have

$$\begin{aligned} 0 \leq \bar{\mu}(C \setminus A) &= \bar{\mu}(C \setminus E) + \bar{\mu}(E \setminus A) \\ &\leq 2\bar{\mu}(B \Delta E) = 2\mu(B \Delta E) = 0. \end{aligned}$$

Therefore $\mu(C \setminus A) = \bar{\mu}(C \setminus A) = 0$

(\Leftarrow) : For any E with the following property,

$\exists A, C \in \text{Dom}(\bar{\mu})$ with $A \subset E \subset C$ s.t. $\mu(C \setminus A) = 0$.

Since $(E \setminus A) \cap (C \setminus A) = \emptyset$ and $\mu(C \setminus A) = 0$, we have $E \setminus A \in \mathcal{N}(\mu)$.

Consider $E = A \cup (E \setminus A)$.

Since $A \in \mathcal{S}$ and $(E \setminus A) \in \mathcal{N}(\mu)$, we have $E \in \mathcal{S} \vee \mathcal{N}(\mu) = \text{Dom}(\bar{\mu})$.

4. (i) : Let C_j be a measurable cover of A_j .

Then C_j is a μ^* -measurable set and

$$\mu^*(C_j) = \mu^*(A_j) \text{ with } C_j \supset A_j.$$

Now, let B be a measurable cover of $\bigcup_j A_j$, then

$$\mu^*\left(\bigcup_j A_j\right) = \mu^*(B) \text{ and } \bigcup_j A_j \subset B.$$

Set $\tilde{C}_j = B \cap C_j$. Thus $A_j \subset \tilde{C}_j$. Moreover, we have

$$\mu^*(A_j) \leq \mu^*(\tilde{C}_j) \leq \mu^*(C_j).$$

$\therefore \tilde{C}_j$ is a measurable cover of A_j .

Consider $\mu^*(C_j \Delta \tilde{C}_j) = \mu^*(C_j \setminus \tilde{C}_j)$.

(a) : If $\mu^*(\tilde{C}_j) = \infty$ for some j

Then $\mu^*(A_j) = \mu^*(C_j) = \mu^*(\tilde{C}_j) = \infty$

$\Rightarrow \mu^*(\bigcup_j C_j) = \mu^*(\bigcup_j A_j) = \infty$ and $(\bigcup_j C_j) \supset (\bigcup_j A_j)$

Therefore $\bigcup_j C_j$ is a measurable cover of $\bigcup_j A_j$.

(b) : If $\mu^*(\tilde{C}_j) < \infty, \forall j$.

Then $\mu^*(C_j \Delta \tilde{C}_j) = \mu^*(C_j) - \mu^*(\tilde{C}_j) = \mu^*(A_j) - \mu^*(A_j) = 0$.

By homework#2,

$$\mu^*\left(\bigcup_j C_j\right) = \mu^*(\tilde{C}_j) \leq \mu^*(B) = \mu^*\left(\bigcup_j A_j\right)$$

Since $(\bigcup_j A_j) \subset (\bigcup_j C_j)$, we have $\mu(\bigcup_j C_j) = \mu^*(\bigcup_j A_j)$.

Therefore $\bigcup_j C_j$ is also a measurable cover of $\bigcup_j A_j$

(ii) There are many examples! For example:

(1) $X = \mathbb{R}, \mathcal{S} = \{A \subset X | A \text{ is countable}\} \cup \{A \subset X | A^c \text{ is countable}\}$.

Write $\mathcal{A}_1 = \{A \subset X | A \text{ is countable}\}$ and $\mathcal{A}_2 = \{A \subset X | A^c \text{ is countable}\}$.

Define

$$m(A) = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{if } A \in \mathcal{A}_1 \\ 1, & \text{if } A \in \mathcal{A}_2 \end{cases}$$

Let $A_1 = (-\infty, 0)$, $A_2 = (0, \infty) \Rightarrow \mu^*(A_1) = \mu^*(A_2) = 1$.

Let $C_1 = C_2 = \mathbb{R}$, then $\mu^*(A_i) = \mu(C_i) = 1, i = 1, 2$.

Thus, $\mu^*(A_1 \cap A_2) = 0 \neq 1 = \mu(\mathbb{R}) = \mu(C_1 \cap C_2)$.

(2) $X = \mathbb{R}$ and m is the counting measure.

Set $A_1 = (0, 1)$ and $A_2 = (1, 2)$ and $C_1 = [0, 1]$, $C_2 = [1, 2]$.

Then $\mu^*(A_i) = \mu^*(C_i) = \infty, i = 1, 2$ and

$\mu^*(A_1 \cap A_2) = 0 \neq 1 = \mu^*(C_1 \cap C_2)$.